

Fake Bad Scale (FBS), Renamed
Symptom Validity Scale (SVS)

References
November 2010
James N. Butcher

This reference file contains articles that address alleged faking of symptoms in personal injury litigation using the Fake Bad Scale, developed in 1991 by Lees-Haley, English, and Glenn. This scale was added to the MMPI-2 Extended Score Report and renamed the Symptom Validity Scale in 2007. An abbreviated version is included as a validity scale on the MMPI-2-RF, released in 2008.

I recommend against use of the FBS as a validity indicator based on my own research, as well as a review of research by others, including the scale's proponents. It is the only MMPI-2 scale that I am aware of that has been successfully challenged in *Frye* hearings and excluded from expert witness testimony (see below for a listing of these cases). The controversy regarding the use of the FBS (SVS) has reached the attention of the mass media and attorneys' groups, including the following (note some of these sources require subscriptions):

Minneapolis Star Tribune:

<http://www.startribune.com/lifestyle/health/52793062.html>

Wall Street Journal: http://online.wsj.com/article/SB120466776681911325.html?mod=todays_us_page_one

Lawyers USA:

<http://lawyersusaonline.com/blog/2008/05/19/plaintiffs-attorney-turns-tables-on-8216fake-bad-scale8217/>

The following is a compiled list of references on the FBS. Ones that I authored or coauthored are available as reprint requests.

Ben-Porath, Y. S., Greve, K. W., Bianchini, K. J., & Kaufmann, P. M. (2009a). The MMPI-2 Symptom Validity Scale (FBS) is an empirically validated measure of over-reporting in personal injury litigants and claimants: Reply to Butcher et al. (2008). *Psychological Injury and Law*, 2(1), 62–85.

Ben-Porath, Y. S., Greve, K. W., Bianchini, K. J., & Kaufmann, P. M. (2009b). The MMPI-2 Symptom Validity Scale (FBS) is an empirically validated measure of over-reporting in personal injury litigants and claimants: Reply to Williams et al. (2009). *Psychological Injury and Law*, www.springerlink.com.

Ben-Porath, Y. S., Graham, J. R. & Tellegen A. (2009). The MMPI-2 Symptom Validity (FBS) Scale Development, Research Findings, and Interpretive Recommendations. Minneapolis, Mn.:

University of Minnesota Press.

Binder, L. M., Storzbach, D., & Salinsky, M. C. (2006). MMPI-2 profiles of persons with multiple chemical sensitivity. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist*, 20(4), 848-857.

Butcher, J. N. (2010). Personality assessment from the nineteenth to the early twenty-first century: Past achievements and contemporary challenges. *Annual Review of Clinical Psychology*, 6, 1-20.

Butcher, J. N., Arbisi, P. A., Atlis, M., & McNulty, J. (2003). The construct validity of the Lees-Haley Fake Bad Scale (FBS): Does this scale measure malingering and feigned emotional distress? *Archives of Clinical Neuropsychiatry*, 18, 473-485.

Butcher, J. N., Arbisi, P. A., Atlis, M. M., & McNulty, J. L. (2008). The construct validity of the Lees-Haley Fake Bad Scale: Does this scale measure somatic malingering and feigned emotional distress? *Archives of Clinical Neuropsychology*, 23(7-8), 855-864.

Butcher, J. N., Gass, C. S., Cumella, E., Kally, Z. & Williams, C. L. (2008). Potential for bias in MMPI-2 assessments using The Fake Bad Scale (FBS). *Psychological Injury and the Law*, 1, 191-209.

Butcher, J. N., & Williams, C. L. (2009). Personality assessment with the MMPI-2: Historical roots, international adaptations, and current challenges. *Applied Psychology: Health and Well-Being*, 2, 105-135.

Cavenagh, N. A. (2009). An analysis of the differential power of the Fake Bad Scale of the MMPI-2. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering*, 69(11-B), 7132.

Cragar, D. E. (2005). Detection of feigned head injury symptoms on the MMPI-2 in head injured patients and community controls. *Archives of Clinical Neuropsychology*, 20(1), 95-110.

Crespo, G. S., Gomez, F. J., Barragan, V. M., & Rueda, A. A. (2007). The contribution of the Fake Bad Scale (FBS) to the Spanish adaptation of the MMPI-2. [Una pobre contribucion de la Escala Fingirse enfermo (FBS) a la adaptacion Espanola del MMPI-2.] *Revista De Psicologia General y Aplicada*, 60(3), 299-313.

Dean, A. C., Boone, K. R., Kim, M. S., Curiel, A. R., Martin, D. J., Victor, T. L., Zeller, M. A. & Lang, Y. K. (2008). Examination of the impact of ethnicity on the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory -2 (MMPI-2) Fake Bad Scale. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist*, 1, 1-7.

Dearth, C. S., Berry, D. T. R., Vickery, C. D., Vagnini, V. L., Baser, R. E., Orey, S. A., & Cragar, D. E. (2005). Detection of feigned head injury symptoms on the MMPI-2 in head injured patients and community controls. *Archives of Clinical Neuropsychology*, 20(1), 95-110.

Downing, S. K., Denney, R. L., Spray, B. J., Houston, C. M., & Halfaker, D. A. (2008). Examining the relationship between the Reconstructed scales and the Fake Bad Scale of the MMPI-2. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist*, 22(4), 680-688.

Dukarm, P. D. (2006). Detecting simulated cognitive impairment with MMPI-2 neurocorrection scales. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering*, 67(6-B), 3447.

Gass, C. S. (2009). Use of the MMPI-2 in Neuropsychological Evaluations. J. N. Butcher (Ed). *Oxford Handbook of Personality Assessment*. (pp. 432-456). New York: Oxford University Press.

[More Information](#)

Gass, C. S., Williams, C. L., Cumella, E., Butcher, J. N. & Kally, Z. (2010). Ambiguous measures of unknown constructs: The MMPI-2 Fake Bad Scale (aka Symptom Validity Scale, FBS, FBS-r). *Psychological Injury and the Law*, Published on line: 22 January, 2010. DOI 10.1007/s 12207-009-9063-2.

Gow, C. H. (2010). Understanding emotional and cognitive factors in symptom validity testing. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering*, 70(7-B), 4483.

Graham, J. R. (2006). *MMPI-2: Assessing personality and psychopathology* (4th Ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.

Greiffenstein, M. F., Fox, D., & Lees-Haley, P. R. (2007). The MMPI-2 Fake Bad Scale in detection of noncredible brain injury claims. In K. Boone (Ed.), *Detection of noncredible cognitive performance*, 210-235. New York: Guilford Press.

Henry, G. K., Heilbronner, R. L., Mittenberg, W., Enders, C., & Stanczak, S. R. (2008). Comparison of the Lees-Haley Fake Bad Scale, Henry-Heilbronner Index, and Restructured Clinical Scale 1 in identifying noncredible symptom reporting. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist*, 22(5), 919-929.

Kwan, K. K., & Maestas, M. L. (2008). MMPI-2 and MCMI-III performances of non-white people in the United States: What we (don't) know and where we go from here. In L.A. Suzuki & J.G. Ponterotto (Eds.), *Handbook of multicultural assessment: Clinical, psychological, and educational applications* (pp. 425-446). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Larrabee, G. J. (1998). Somatic malingering on the MMPI and MMPI-2 in personal injury litigants. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist*, 12, 179-188.

Lees-Haley, P. R., English, L. T., & Glenn, W. T. (1991). A fake-bad scale on the MMPI-2 for personal injury claimants. *Psychological Reports*, 68, 203-310.

Lees-Haley P.R. (1992). Efficacy of MMPI-2 validity scales and MCMI-II modifier scales for detecting spurious PTSD claims: F, F-K, Fake Bad Scale, Ego Strength, Subtle-Obvious Subscales, Dis. and Deb. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 48:681-689.

Lees-Haley, P. R., & Fox, D. D. (2004). Commentary on Butcher, Arbisi, Atlis, and McNulty (2003) on the Fake Bad Scale. *Archives of Clinical Neuropsychology*, 19(3), 333-336.

- Locke, D. E. C., Kirilin, K. A., Thomas, M. L., Osborne, D., Hurst, D. F., Drazkowski, J. F., Sirven, J. I., & Noe, K. H. (2010). The Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory-2-Restructured Form in the epilepsy monitoring unit. *Epilepsy & Behavior, 17*(2), 252-258.
- Nelson, N. W., Hoelzle, J. B., Sweet, J. J., Arbisi, P. A., & Demakis, G. J. (2010). Updated Meta-Analysis Of The MMPI-2 Symptom Validity Scale (FBS): Verified Utility In Forensic practice. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist, 24*: 701–724
- Nelson, N. W., Parsons, T. D., Grote, C. L., Smith, C. A., & Sisung, J. R. I. I. (2006). The MMPI-2 fake bad scale: Concordance and specificity of true and estimated scores. *Journal of Clinical and Experimental Neuropsychology, 28*(1), 1-12.
- Nelson, N. W., Hoelzle, J. B., Sweet, J. J., Arbisi, P. A., & Demakis, G. J. (2010). Updated meta-analysis of the MMPI-2 symptom validity scale (FBS): Verified utility in forensic practice. *The Clinical Neuropsychologist, 24*(4), 701-724.
- Nelson, N. W., Sweet, J. J., & Heilbronner, R. L. (2007). Examination of the new MMPI-2 Response Bias Scale (Gervais): Relationship with MMPI-2 validity scales. *Journal of Clinical and Experimental Neuropsychology, 29*(1), 67-72.
- Nichols, D.S., Greene, R., & Williams C.L. (2009, March). *Gender bias in the MMPI-2 Fake Bad Scale (FBS) and FBS-r in MMPI-2-RF*. Paper given at the at the Society for Personality Assessment, Chicago
- Pearson Assessments. (2007a, January 11). *MMPI-2 Fake Bad Scale (FBS): FBS added to the MMPI-2 standard scoring materials* [Press Release]. Retrieved September 3, 2007, from <http://www.pearsonassessments.com/news/pr011107.htm>
- Pearson Assessments. (2007b, January 11). *FBS (Symptom Validity Scale) Added to MMPI-2 Standard Scoring Materials: Scale Helps Identify Non-credible Reporting* [Press Release]. Retrieved November 12, 2007, from <http://www.pearsonassessments.com/news/pr011107.htm>

Pope, K. S., Butcher, J. N., & Seelen, J. (2006). *The MMPI/MMPI-2/MMPI-A in Court (3rd Ed.)* Washington DC: American Psychological Association.

[More Information](#)

Rogers R., Sewell K.W., Salekin R.T. (1994). A meta-analysis of malingering on the MMPI-2. *Assessment*, 1:227-237.

Sims, D, Perrillo, R.& Berman, R. An Autopsy on the Fake Bad Scale: The Political and Scientific Ramifications of the Methodology and Application of the Fake Bad Scale Against Persons with Brain Impairment. International Brain Injury Association.
<http://internationalbrain.org/?q=node/110>

Sisung, J. R. J. (2006). Predictive utility of the MMPI-2 Fake Bad Scale on Wisconsin Card Sorting test performance during forensic traumatic brain evaluations. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering*, 66(11-B), 6330.

Staudenmayer, H., & Phillips, S. (2007). MMPI-2 validity, clinical and content scales, and the Fake Bad Scale for personal injury litigants claiming idiopathic environmental intolerance. *Journal of Psychosomatic Research*, 62(1), 61-72.

Williams, C. L., Butcher, J. N., Gass, C. S., Cumella, E., & Kally, Z.(2009). Inaccuracies about the MMPI-2 fake bad scale in the reply by Ben-Porath, Greve, Bianchini, and Kaufmann (2009). *Psychological Injury and Law*, 2, 182–197.

Court Rulings On The FBS (SVS)

Frye Hearings:

Davidson v. Strawberry Petroleum et al., Case #05-4320 (Hillsborough County, Florida, 2007).

Stith v State Farm Mutual Insurance, Case No. 50-2003 CA 010945AG, Palm Beach County, Florida, 2008).

Vandergracht v. Progressive Express et al., Case #02-04552, (Hillsborough County, Florida, 2007)

Williams v. CSX Transportation, Inc., Case #04-CA-008892 (Hillsborough County, Florida, 2007).

Limbaugh-Kirker v Dicosta Case No 06-CA-00706 20th District Circuit Ct. 2009 Florida

Anderson v E & S Enterprises Case No. RG05-211076 Superior Court of Alameda Co., California.